



MINUTES OF THE 59TH ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING (AGM) OF THE SELANGOR BAR HELD ON THURSDAY, 22ND FEBRUARY 2024 PHYSICALLY.

At 3.00pm before the meeting was called to order, M K Thas the Chairman of the Selangor Bar Committee (SBC) requested all pupils to be seated at the chairs which are red in colour and the members to be seated at the other seats. The Chairman then reminded the hall that the meeting is only meant for Selangor Bar members.

The Chairman then requested that all the handphones to be muted. Before proceeding with the meeting, the Chairman addressed the house rules and stated that Section 70 of the Legal Profession Act 1976 (LPA) states that the Selangor Bar's AGM is only for the members of the Selangor Bar. He added that registration has taken place outside the hall and for some reason if there are any non-Selangor Bar members present, he politely requested for the non-members to leave the hall.

Anand Raj introduced himself as the Bar Council representative and informed that he has registered and given his name card to the officers at the registration counter. He then referred to Section 70 of the LPA and informed that non-state bar members can't attend and vote. He continued that he is present not to vote and he has informed the officers at the registration counter that he will sit at the pupils' seat and not the members' seats, however the officer at the registration counter informed that he can sit at the members seats.

The Chairman queried as to who is the officer who handled their registration. Anand Raj replied that he did not take down the officer's name. Anand Raj continued that he and his colleague are here to speak on LexisNexis (LN) Motion only and the President of the Bar Council is waiting outside the hall and would like to be invited in. He added that all members regardless of states are under the same house rules which is the LPA and do not see how they can be excluded to address this issue. He continued that the Bar Council is the governing body of the Malaysian Bar and do not see as to why they should be excluded and request the Chairman to allow them be present and speak. They will remain seated at the pupils' seats until they are called up to speak and will leave the meeting once the voting process takes place. They are only here to address the LN issue only. Vivek then stood up and introduced himself and mentioned the same.

Sandosh Anandhan stood up and informed the Chairman that with due respect to the earlier two (2) speakers, that this is a closed meeting and to inform that you will attend and will not vote is actually participating in the meeting as attending and voting comes together. As such, the attendance of the Bar Council representatives to address the floor is not a correct and mentioned to the Chairman that allowing the Bar Council representatives to attend the meeting would eventually lead to dispute because they are not eligible to attend. He continued that registration at the counter does not make a person eligible to attend the Selangor Bar's AGM as Selangor Bar members are required to pay subscription to the Selangor Bar.

Farez Jinnah requested to the Chairman to allow their presence and mentioned that they are here to address the LN motion only. He added that it must be recorded that Selangor Bar members are deprived the opportunity to listen about this motion and the contents of the Malaysian Bar's



circular which was disseminated earlier today. If the attendance of the two (2) Bar Council representatives are not allowed in accordance of the Section 70, it is wrong as the Selangor Bar members need to be enlightened of this issue.

Ravi informed the Chairman with regard to Section 70 of the LPA and informed that we must adhere to it.

Vishnu Kumar read the Section 70 of the LPA and informed the Chairman that only members of Selangor Bar can attend the meeting and it does not give the prerogative to any non-Selangor Bar members to attend. The legislation is very clear as to who can attend state bar AGM. Members of the Selangor Bar who pay the subscription to the Selangor Bar can attend and other state members are not eligible to attend. Even though we are under the same umbrella of the Malaysian Bar, we can't use the excuse to attend other state bar AGMs. As for Section 64 of the LPA, it states that it is entirely for all Malaysian Bar members and the legislations are very clear as to who can attend the state bar and Malaysian Bar AGMs.

Anand Raj stood up and informed the Chairman that they have registered and allowed to enter the hall and would like to be heard of their view on the LN motion. He again informed that the President is still waiting outside.

The Chairman informed that the meeting is yet to be convened properly and the Selangor Bar's stand will be in accordance of the statutes and humbly requested for them to leave the hall.

Anand Raj informed that the interpretation of Sec. 70 is noted. Bernard Scott informed that as point of order, non-Selangor Bar members should not be present. The Chairman then humbly requested them to leave the hall. Anand Raj and Vivek left the hall.

The Chairman informed that members present to wear their tag and to inform their name if they wish to speak at the mic provided and are given 3 minutes each as there are online members who wish to speak and they can do so by doing via the chat box.

The Chairman requested all present to observe a minute of silence as a mark of respect in reference for all members who have passed on since the date of the last Annual General Meeting, namely Ahmad Zulkifli Bin Mohamed Nawawi, Malliga A/P G V Sumathi, Kovil Pillai Francis, Joseph A/L Lourdesamy, Dato' Pahamin Bin Ab. Rajab, Theviga Mohanna, Kee Li Ling, Noor Hanani Binti Musa, Kiran Kaur Ram A/P Ramu Naido, Che Sarif Bin Matt, Chin Teck Wah, Haris Fathillah Sam Sathiasingam Bin Mohamed Ibrahim, Melvinder Singh A/L Manjit Singh, Chan Chee Leong, John Bosco A/L John Istiland Fernandez, Dato' Haji Sulaiman Bin Abdullah and Datin Jothi Mathi A/P Kanthasamy.

Before proceeding with the agenda, the Chairman informed all present about the printing error starting from page 23 (Chairman's Report) which should be stated as page 23. The Chairman then informed the hall that as for the purpose of clarity we are going to follow the numbers printed and the amendments will be made at the next meeting.

**ITEM 1 OF AGENDA:**

To consider, and if approved, to adopt the minutes of the 58th Annual General Meeting held on Wednesday, 23rd February 2023

- 1.1 Choi Kian You referred to page 19 of the report and informed the Chairman to follow the procedure of the nominations of the Chairman, Eugene Roy was also nominated for Chairman which came from the chat box but there was no seconder because the 2 senior members who presided over the agenda did not pick up the said nomination. He added that it must be recorded. The Chairman took note.
- 1.2 As there were no amendments to the minutes of the 58th Annual General Meeting, the minutes were approved and adopted, proposed by Ajeet Kaur and seconded by Ramesh Lachmanan.

ITEM 2 OF AGENDA:

To discuss matters arising there from.

- 2.1 There were no matters arising.

ITEM 3 OF AGENDA:

To consider the Reports on the activities of the Selangor Bar for the year 2023/2024

3.1 Chairman's Report

- 3.1.1 As there were no queries, Dato' Rajpal Singh proposed and Gabriel Susayan seconded. Vishnu Kumar informed the Chairman that the reports of the sub-committee inclusive of the Chairman's report must be gone through first before approving it rather than approving it one by one as that's how it is done by convention. The Chairman took note.
- 3.1.2 Yohendra Nadarajan informed the Chairman that the van shuttle service at the Shah Alam Court was a good idea in assisting members who were facing difficulties to secure a parking spot. He then queried as to why it was stopped and why it was not communicated to the members. The Chairman replied that the van shuttle service was implemented during the Covid-19 period where the access to the Shah Alam court was limited and members have to park all over outside of the court area. This year, everything was opened up and parking inside the court was made easy to members to access. Observations were made and the van shuttle was hardly used and there were several occasions where the driver was not doing his job and the van was just parked. The committee looked into the financial aspect (RM5,000.00 per month) for the service and found it is not viable. He added that we must be prudent in spending members money and decided to discontinue the said service. The Chairman also informed that the committee did not receive any complaints from members about the discontinuance of the van shuttle service.



3.2 Conveyancing Practice

- 3.2.1 A.G. Kalidas suggested to the Chairman that the issue of KPKT, whereby for the sale and purchase, if it is from the developer, we have to go through the system. He is of the view that we need to safeguard this and cannot allow the KPKT system prepare the sale and purchase agreement. He added that now developers will have to key in and submit all the purchasers' particulars and they are not governed by PDPA and the Sale & Purchase agreements will be generated by them. This will affect the conveyancers. He urged that at the National level, we must look into this issue and it should not be allowed. He then requested the incoming committee to raise this issue at National level. The Chairman took note and thanked A.G. Kalidas for his suggestion.

3.3 District Representative

- 3.3.1 Salim Bashir commented on the posters in page 73 to page 76 and suggested to the Chairman for the report to be prepared in detail. The Chairman thanked and apologised to Salim Bashir.

3.4 Human Rights, The Environment & Gender Equality

- 3.4.1 Yohendra Nadarajan informed the Chairman that his name was omitted from the sub-committee list as he has attended a few meetings and affirmed that the Co-Chairpersons can verify the matter. The Chairman took note.

3.5 Legal Aid Centre Selangor (LACS) & YBGK

- 3.5.1 Suzana Ismail informed the Chairman there are still issues with YBGK lawyers who are touting for their own firm and for the other lawyers. The Chairman replied that a complaint has been lodged to the Touting Committee, BC, where circulars have been issued and the Chairman informed Suzana Ismail that he took note of the concern raised.
- 3.5.2 Salim Bashir added that this maybe a problem not only in Selangor but throughout the country and suggested to the Chairman that a guideline should be created at National level for the courts not to disclose the general list (represented or not) to YBGK lawyers. He also requested the LACS & YBGK Chairperson to take note that the guidelines may inform the courts to include the names which are not represented only to YBGK lawyers. The Chairman thanked Salim Bashir for his suggestion.

3.6 Publication

- 3.6.1 Choi Kian You informed the Chairman that the font size of the Annual Report were not standardised and suggested for the matter to be fixed in the future. He added that there



must be reports instead of pictures/posters as it does not look good for an annual report. The Chairman took note.

- 3.6.2 Dato' Rajpal Singh referred to Adrem magazine and informed that there are pictures without any narrative and suggested to the Chairman for the incoming committee to mention the purpose of photos in the AdRem magazine. The Chairman thanked Dato' Rajpal Singh for the suggestion.
- 3.6.3 Choi Kian You informed that the mic should be connected to the system rather than using the laptop to pick up the voice from the speakers. The members attending online can't hear it properly.
- 3.6.4 Fahri Azzat informed the Chairman that everyone attending the meeting via zoom is complaining that they can't hear anything and it is blur. We need to rectify this as many members are being left out. Dato' Rajpal Singh informed that maybe the service provider can increase the volume. Chan Chee Thong informed the Chairman that members online are saying that they can hear a lot of echo and background sound. After adjusting the volume, the sound was tested and members online informed that it is much better now.

3.7 Sports, Recreation & Health

- 3.7.1 Annou Xavier recorded his appreciation to Eugene Roy, for organising the Inter Professional Virtual Chess, of which Selangor Bar has won 5 out of 6 trophies. He then thanked the Selangor Bar Committee and Eugene Roy for organising the largest Inter-State Bar Games 2023. The Chairman thanked Annou Xavier.

3.8 Syariah & Bahasa Melayu

- 3.8.1 Suzana commented to the Chairman that she has served the committee previously as the Chairperson for Bahasa Melayu sub-committee and lately she did not see any programme under the Bahasa Melayu portfolio. She continued that she has managed to secure a trophy worth RM15,000.00 for the Selangor Bar and the trophy is not being used for the debate competition. She then requested the incoming committee to organise a debate competition and use the trophy.
- 3.8.2 Suria informed the Chairman that she is a committee member for Bahasa Melayu Committee, BC and informed that at the end of last year, they have organised a Pertandingan Pantun Undang-Undang in Bahasa Melayu and a Pertandingan Hujahan Undang-undang early March this year at UIA. She continued that the Bahasa Melayu Committee was inactive maybe due to the Covid pandemic and has started to become active again. The Chairman thanked Suria.
- 3.8.3 The Chairman informed the floor that as for Syariah sub-committee, the Selangor Bar Committee has organised a meeting with Selangor Sharie lawyers which were not being



mentioned in the report. With regard to the comment made by Suzana Ismail, the Chairman informed that he has taken an action to identify the trophies that have not been active during his chairmanship. One of the trophies is the trophy for Pertandingan Debat known as Piala Time Orient and he will identify the trophy mentioned by Suzana Ismail as the secretariat would need some time to look for the trophy. The Chairman continued that the incoming committee will take note of the concern raised and will organise more Bahasa Melayu programmes in the next term.

- 3.8.4 The Chairman then informed Suria that Selangor Bar has sent representatives for the Pertandingan Pantun Kebangsaan co-organised by UIA and UKM. The Chairman further informed that a circular was issued for getting members to participate. He mentioned further that the incoming committee will look into this matter. The Chairman then informed that the Selangor Bar representatives won the best dress (busana terbaik) in the said competition.

3.9 Young Lawyers & Pupils

- 3.9.1 Cindy informed the Chairman about the issue in communicating with the secretariat office. She continued that her pupil kept contacting the secretariat office to check the file for almost one hour but no one answered the calls. The Chairman took note and informed Cindy that the committee needs more details on the matter. Cindy replied that they have the call records. The Chairman replied that the incoming committee will look into this matter.

3.10 Selangor Bar Representative

- 3.10.1 Gabriel Susayan referred to the last paragraph in page 154 where it mentioned the various roles of the Selangor Bar Representative and commented that he only saw the report on LexisNexis but no reports for other committees. He specifically queried about the report under Ad Hoc Committee for Touting or touting issues in Selangor.
- 3.10.2 The Chairman replied that the report for touting is in the page 164. Gabriel Susayan then apologised to the Bar representative.
- 3.10.3 Bernard Scott queried whether the issue of Lexis Nexis will be discussed based on this report or based on the Motion later. The Chairman answered that it will be discussed based on the Motion.
- 3.10.4 Ramesh Lachmanan referred to page 159 and requested the Chairman to highlight the members on the total fund granted by the state government, what are the sums used by the Selangor Bar and how many people have benefited from the DBGS program. The Chairman informed Ramesh Lachmanan that the issue will be discussed at the accounts part. Ramesh Lachmanan took note.



- 3.10.5 Yohendra Nadarajan queried the Chairman as to why there was no specific report on the breakdown on DBGS programme in the annual report unlike last year. The Chairman replied that the incoming committee will look into this.
- 3.10.6 The reports were approved and adopted, proposed by Chan Chee Thong and seconded by Ramesh Lachmanan.

ITEM 4 OF AGENDA:

To consider, and if approved, to adopt the Audited Accounts of the Selangor Bar for the year ending 31st December, 2023

- 4.1 The Chairman handed over Item 5 of the Agenda to the Honorary Secretary, Yu Ai Ting. Yu Ai Ting then tabled the Audited Accounts of the Selangor Bar for the year ending 31st December, 2023.
- 4.2 A.G. Kalidas referred to page 204 with regard to the staff bonus and allowances and sought clarification whether the bonus and allowances for 2023 was paid in current year (2024) as it is not reflected in the accounts. The Chairman replied that it is correct.
- 4.3 A.G. Kalidas then queried as to how much the amount was in order to know how much was exactly spent for the year 2023. Yu Ai Ting informed A.G. Kalidas that the bonus which were paid in February 2024 is RM21,728.00. She added that the allowances which are the overtime had been paid off in 2023. A.G. Kalidas thanked Yu Ai Ting for her explanation.
- 4.4 Annou Xavier referred to page 191 and informed the floor that the surplus for 2023 is RM362,344.00 and recorded his appreciation and congratulated the Chairman and the committee. Yu Ai Ting added that the actual surplus is RM241,147.00 for 2023.
- 4.5 Wee Su Lin informed Yu Ai Ting that the Bonus for staff for 2023 was RM22,263.00 and for 2022 was RM126,973.00. Yu Ai Ting replied that it was for 8 staff in 2023. Wee Su Lin queried whether staffs were given a lower bonus or hardly any bonus was given. She further queried about the lower allocation of bonus given to the secretariat staffs and whether the performance of the secretariat staff have deteriorated which affected the allocation of bonus. She added that usually the bonus will be based on the performance of the staff as she has served as the Honorary Secretary previously and queried again as to why the bonus has gone down so much.
- 4.6 A.G. Kalidas informed the Chairman that he knew the staff and they are excellent but as for bonus, it is totally the prerogative of the committee to decide. He continued that the performance of the secretariat staff cannot be discussed in the AGM. The Chairman thanked A.G. Kalidas.
- 4.7 Salim Bashir informed the Chairman that he is yet to answer to Ramesh Lachmanan's query on DBGS programme. He further referred to page 191 and commented that there



was a disbursement of RM19,320.00 for DBGS in year 2002 and there was none in 2023. He requested for clarification from Yu Ai Ting.

- 4.8 Yu Ai Ting informed that the grant received from the Selangor state government is RM300,000.00 in 2021 inclusive of RM3,320.00 for operational cost in the year 2022 but there was no fund received for operational cost in the year 2023. She then added that the operational cost for 2023 is to be deducted from the grant of RM300,000.00. She continued that the payment for DBGS lawyer has been increased from RM1,500.00 to RM3,000.00 starting from June 2023. Yu Ai Ting informed further that the total payment to DBGS lawyers for 2023 is RM48,000.00 from January to December 2023.
- 4.9 Yu Ai Ting informed further that after deducting the operational cost for 2023, the current balance for DBGS is RM148,133.67 which is part of the RM181,808.00 as referred in page 202.
- 4.10 Dato' Rajpal Singh queried Yu Ai Ting as to the DBGS fund of RM1,000,000.00 from the state government for the DBGS programme. Yu Ai Ting replied that the initial amount given by the state government was RM300,000.00. She continued that once the fund is spent close to RM90,000.00 to RM80,000.00, Selangor Bar has to apply for a new grant and the balance of RM700,000.00 is still with the state government.
- 4.11 Chan Chee Tong queried about the allocation of bonus and allowances for secretariat staff which shows a big discrepancy as compared to the previous year and requested for an explanation. The Chairman replied and quoted A.G. Kalidas' statement earlier that staff matter will not be discussed in the AGM.
- 4.12 Ramesh Lachmanan referred to item number 9 of page 202 and commented to Yu Ai Ting that all the money spent under DBGS fund and all relevant balances should be put in detail for clarity purposes in the future. He further commented that the money used for DBGS should not be put together with other money in the account because the money is the state government's money and not Selangor Bar's money. Yu Ai Ting replied that she also agrees with Ramesh Lachmanan's view and she has proposed the same to the current committee. She continued that the incoming committee will look into it.
- 4.13 A.G. Kalidas referred to page 191 and queried about the notable difference on the subscription fees in 2022 and 2023 as to how much was the arrears for the subscription fees in 2023. Yu Ai Ting replied that the difference was not because of the arrears but the subscription fees in 2023 was reduced to RM200.00 per member instead of RM260.00 per member in 2022. She mentioned further that the reimbursement from BC for Lexis Nexis was RM400,680.00 and the total subscription received was almost RM1.8million which is almost similar to the total income for subscription in 2022. A.G. Kalidas thanked Yu Ai Ting for the explanation.
- 4.14 With regard to the DBGS, Navin Punj informed the Chairman that on 8th February 2024, the Selangor state government has conducted a visit or a spot check to the secretariat and requested for an explanation. The Chairman replied that it was a routine usual visit by the



- state government to the secretariat and the incoming committee will be looking into the particular exercise which has taken place on that day.
- 4.15 The Chairman then further informed Navin Punj that this is an internal issue which took place based on confidentiality and queried him as to how this information came out. The Chairman then requested Navin Punj to reveal the source of the information as Navin Punj seems to know the internal issue of the secretariat. Navin Punj replied that the Chairman has confirmed about the visit and affirmed about that matter. The Chairman further queried about the source of information again. Navin Punj replied that he can't answer and apologised to the Chairman.
- 4.16 Gabriel Susayan informed the Chairman that as a point of order, everything transpires in the committee meetings are private and confidential. He added that it does not augur well when a member queries the Chairman on what happened in the secretariat. He commented further that Navin Punj must inform the members about the source of the information. The Chairman replied to Gabriel Susayan that the incoming committee will look into the question raised by Navin Punj. Gabriel Susayan mentioned further that what transpired in the committee meetings should not be talked outside. The Chairman thanked Gabriel Susayan and mentioned about Section 76 of the LPA with regards to the confidentiality.
- 4.17 A.G. Kalidas queried the Chairman whether the matter was spoken in the committee meeting which was governed by the LPA and it was invoked or it is something that happened in the secretariat which cannot be governed by secrecy, to label it as a matter of confidentiality. A.G. Kalidas informed the Chairman that he was the one that initiated the DBGS programme and queried the Chairman on the current status of the DBGS program, whether the committee is still running and the results of the recent audit which took place.
- 4.18 The Chairman replied that there were no results from the audit and the committee is still running the DBGS program. A.G. Kalidas queried whether the committee has enough money to run the DBGS programme. The Chairman replied we have sufficient fund to run the programme. A.G. Kalidas thanked the Chairman for his reply.
- 4.19 Choi Kian You referred to the bonus and allowances, and informed the Chairman that a breakdown must be shown as there is a huge difference between 2023 and 2022 and it is for members' better understanding. He then referred to page 191 and mentioned about the huge drop of the sports expenses which was from RM110,601.00 in 2023 to RM530 in 2022.
- 4.20 Yu Ai Ting replied that in year 2022 Selangor Bar hosted the Interstate Bar Games (ISBG) and RM110,601.00 is the fund paid by Malaysian Bar to Selangor Bar for organising the event. Yu Ai Ting further explained that RM530.00 is actually payment from the Bowling Competition organised by Selangor Bar in 2023. Choi Kian You sought clarification on the bonus and increment. Yu Ai Ting replied that as agreed, it is not to be discussed in the AGM.



- 4.21 Sandosh Anandhan informed the Chairman that the question is out of order because it should have asked at the last AGM or to the 2022 committee or the previous Chairman. The Chairman thanked Sandosh Anandhan.
- 4.22 The Audited Accounts were then approved, proposed by Bani Prakash and seconded by Chuah Sieh Mann.

ITEM 6 OF AGENDA :

To discuss and approved the Annual Report of Selangor Bar Committee to be sent by way of email only to the members.

- 6.1 Before proceeding with Item 5 of the Agenda, the Chairman informed the members that we will proceed with Item 6 first and followed by Item 7 and 5 because it is connected to the members' subscription.
- 6.2 The Chairman informed the members that the current committee would like to appraise the expenses incurred in the exercise of preparing the CD for Annual Report and also added the sending out of the AGM notice.
- 6.3 He continued that the cost incurred in 2022 for CD was RM36,461.60 and for the purposes of sending out the notice of AGM was RM15,750.00 and in total came up to RM52,211.60.
- 6.4 The Chairman continued that as of this year, the committee managed to reduce the cost to RM37,359.00 by posting the CD and AGM notice together. He informed further that the committee is of the view that the expenses incurred are unnecessary because there are not many members who would use CD to read the Annual Report and CDs have become obsolete and we are wasting resources. As for the AGM notices, the Chairman further informed that the committee is of the view that every member has email address and it is sufficient to send the AGM notice via email instead of wasting resources and to avoid wasting our members money and usage of papers. He then sought the approval of the members to stop sending Annual Report by CD and AGM notices by post and to send the Annual Report and AGM notice by way of email.
- 6.5 Dato' Rajpal Singh informed the Chairman that he agrees to the discontinuation of sending Annual Report by CD and AGM notices by post. He then queried the Chairman whether hard copy for Annual Report will be provided to members attending the AGM physically and mentioned further that the AGM via online is very difficult and frustrating. The Chairman replied that hard copy of Annual Report will be provided to members attending the AGM physically.
- 6.6 The Chairman queried the members present whether there are any objections. Wee Su Lin informed the Chairman to enquire members who are attending online as well. The Chairman replied that so far there are no objections and queried online members to reply in the chat box. As the response was no objection, the motion was carried.

**ITEM 7 OF AGENDA :****To consider Motion/s tabled**

- 7.1 The Chairman informed the members that the motion is proposed by the Honorary Secretary, Yu Ai Ting and she will preside over Item 7 of the Agenda.
- 7.2 The Chairman informed members that the motion is about whether to continue to subscribe to LexisNexis (LN) online services. The Chairman informed the floor in regards to the Bar Council (BC) decision concerns that any negotiation and finalising of any agreement with LN by state bars to subscribe to LN could be in breach of Anti-Competition Law. The Chairman continued further that the BC has decided following the majority votes that it is a life issue which could exposed the BC being sued. The Chairman informed further that the motion is drafted to seek the mandate of the August house to reflect the voice of the Selangor Bar. The Chairman then added that the President have indicated that she will not sign the agreement if the Selangor Bar decided to extend the LN agreement.
- 7.3 The Chairman informed the floor that Selangor Bar has expressed our view to be allowed to continue with the existing agreement which has started since 2018 and it is also funded by Selangor Bar without any financial force to BC.
- 7.4 The Chairman added further that Selangor Bar Committee (SBC) wants the members of the Selangor Bar to decide for all 7000 plus members of the Selangor Bar. He added that before tabling the motion, the SBC has informed the BC and BC has requested to restrict the tabling of the motion or to withdraw the motion. He continued that the SBC disagreed and decided to proceed with the motion and give the opportunity to all Selangor Bar members to decide. The Chairman then invited Yu Ai Ting, the Honorary Secretary to propose and table the motion and informed the floor that subsequently the motion will be opened for deliberation.
- 7.5 Yu Ai Ting informed the members that in the motion there will be 2 questions, whereby the first question is whether to continue with the subscription to the LN services. She mentioned further that even though the motion not supposed to be tabled, the motion is constructed in such a way for members to decide whether the subscription should be continued. She then referred to the first paragraph of the motion and informed that the Selangor Bar has engaged with LN since 2018. She then informed the members that last year's agreement with LN will expire on 28th February, 2024.
- 7.6 Yu Ai Ting explained to the floor that the contract was entered for a period of one year because Selangor Bar has accepted the proposal by BC that BC is supposed to enter the negotiation to subscribe LN for all the state bars inclusive of the Selangor Bar. She informed further that with Selangor Bar has accepted to said proposal, BC has agreed to pay on the basis of equal footing with the rest of the Members to pay RM60.00 per member. Selangor Bar also collected RM60 per member last year. She then added that with BC given free Lexis Nexis to all other states except Selangor Bar, BC has reimbursed the amount of RM400,680.00 (based on RM60.00 per member) and the total



subscription for the LN contract last year was RM551,200.00. She added further that the balance of RM150,520.00 was funded by the Selangor Bar. Therefore Selangor Bar members only paid RM200.00 last term.

- 7.7 Yu Ai Ting informed further that SBC decided to table the motion due to the decision made by BC that SBC should not enter into any negotiation with LN. She informed that the quote given by LN was RM550,000.00 (RM594,000.00 inclusive of 8% SST) per year which comes to RM81.00 per member. She added that at first the quote from LN for year One is RM546,000.00 and for 2nd year is RM573,000.00. Thereafter, upon request by LN change amount to RM550,000.00 per year for a contract of two years.
- 7.8 Yu Ai Ting informed further that the products are as listed in paragraph G in the motion and the SBC is now seeking this August House's decision whether to continue with the subscription because the current subscription will expire on 28th February 2024.
- 7.9 Ramesh Lachmanan informed that before the house decides, can the members know the stand of SBC on the motion.
- 7.10 A. G. Kalidas informed that the motion is by the committee and cannot pass the burden to the floor and the committee must be committed on the motion. The motion is proposed by the committee and do not waste the members' time.
- 7.11 Yu Ai Ting replied that majority of the committee decided to proceed with the motion to continue with the subscription because Selangor Bar should not be compared with other states bar that do not have LN services. She added that the SBC cannot adhere to the decision made by BC to safeguard our privilege.
- 7.12 Gabriel Susayan queried Yu Ai Ting that whether the committee is going to proceed with the motion or not. A.G. Kalidas commented to the Chairman and Yu Ai Ting to stand firm by their stand without the need to require for all members' decision on the motion as the committee are the one who proposed the motion. Yu Ai Ting then affirmed the floor that her stand is to continue with the LN subscription.
- 7.13 Choi Kian You informed Yu Ai Ting to amend the date in the motion from 28th February 2024 to 29th February 2024. Yu Ai Ting took note.
- 7.14 Shankar Sundaram informed the Chairman that he disagrees with the motion. He added that we have the LN since 2018 but 2 years ago, BC has passed a motion at the Malaysian Bar's AGM for 3 online service providers and he is compelled now to pay another RM60.00 for LN services to the Selangor Bar. He continued that the current 3 online services subscribed by members through BC is sufficient enough and we need not to have LN services. He further informed that he strongly object to the decision made by Bar Council in instructing the SBC on what can and cannot be done by state bars. He then expressed his view that the motion should be tabled for the members to decide.



- 7.15 Annou Xavier informed the Chairman that he supports the motion for renewal and proposed that we put to vote on Motion 1 and move on.
- 7.16 Sandosh Anandhan informed the Chairman that the office bearers of the BC have attempted to highjack the meeting as it is a very pertinent issue which needs deliberation. He added that he fully supports the motion for the continuation of subscription to LN and suggested the Chairman to listen to the member's view and move on.
- 7.17 Ramesh Lachmanan informed the Chairman that he supports the motion and recorded his appreciation to the SBC that subscription to LN has assisted him on the legal research and majority of the smaller firms in Selangor only needs to pay a small fee of RM60.00 per member. He then informed the Chairman to continue with the subscription and thanked the Chairman.
- 7.18 Dato' Rajpal Singh queried Yu Ai Ting whether Motion 1 and 2 is one Motion. Yu Ai Ting replied yes. Dato' Rajpal Singh informed that the committee to withdraw Motion 1 since the committee stands by Motion 1 and replace it with motion 2 instead. Yu Ai Ting informed that we need the mandate from the members. He took note and queried whether the Motions will be voted separately or together. Yu Ai Ting replied that we need to do it one by one. Dato' Rajpal Singh queried further whether the votes for Motion 1 will be tallied before Motion 2 is deliberated. Yu Ai Ting added that the committee will listen to members' view first before proceeding with the voting. Dato' Rajpal Singh thanked Yu Ai Ting.
- 7.19 Bernard Scott queried the Chairman with regard to what transpired between the BC and the SBC in relation to the LN subscription. He further informed that we have worked very hard to obtain such service for the members since 2018. He further requested the Chairman or perhaps the Bar Representative to clarify and explain to the floor on the contention of the BC against the subscription of LN by the Selangor Bar. The Chairman proposed that we hear to Fahri Azzat and Farez Jinnah's explanation on the said matter.
- 7.20 Fahri Azzat informed the floor that there is no sense of division as everyone at the BC is looking at issues from a National perspective and in a broader perspective and not only Selangor Bar. We are all brothers and sisters in practice of different areas of law. He added that LN is a corporate profit-making entity from their services/products. Splitting us by states makes them making more money because we do not have the collective bargaining power as it varies from state to state.
- 7.21 He further informed that other state bars do not have the collective bargaining power like Selangor does, able to subscribe to LN separately on its own. Fahri Azzat mentioned further that he has the duty not only to Selangor Bar but to other state bars as well as a council member. He informed all the members that he wants Selangor Bar to lead the other states and all other state bar members. He then informed that the BC objected the motion because they want the Selangor Bar to be united with the rest of Semenanjung Malaysia and not only Selangor alone during this trying times. He added that we do not want LN to come and say that there is difference between Selangor Bar and BC. We all



must be in the same page and every member should have the same privilege as Selangor Bar. He wants everyone members present to have the awareness for the benefit of every member. He then requested the Selangor Bar to sacrifice in order for all of us to move together so for the long run we can get a good deal for everyone. He requested the SBC to withdraw the motion for a greater good for all members of other states.

- 7.22 Fahri Azzat informed further that BC is the highest entity that governs all states hence only BC can sign the agreement with LN. He requested the floor to give it a thought.
- 7.23 Farez Jinnah recorded his affirmation on what Fahri Azzat has spoken earlier. He added that earlier it was a consumerist decision we did it for our members with a good rate. But as we mature and understand the nature and how it affects other state bars. He is a council member and he was voted by all members and not only Selangor. He mentioned further about his visit to Perlis Bar and informed that Perlis Bar has only around 60 plus members, hence they do not have strong collective bargaining power as we do. He continued that Selangor Bar has to set up an example to other state bars by leading them in this matter.
- 7.24 Farez Jinnah informed further that the motion should not be proposed by a committee but from the members. He added that collective responsibility applies both ways whether we like it and not. He added that last year the BC has reimbursed the Selangor Bar on the LN subscription and now with the financial implication, what is lacking in the motion is the members to decide whether we are financially viable or not and not withstanding our sentiment on this issue. He then queried whether we have the data that says it is financially viable for all the members to pay for RM60.00 per user or maybe the number of usage is very small. He does not have the said data and added further that the motion is problematic as it goes to our moral compass and we may face consequences. Farez Jinnah added that we have 7000 plus members and all the other members are looking at us now. With that he humbly requested the committee to withdraw the motion or to vote against the motion. He then informed the Chairman and the committee that he objects to the motion. It has to be known as he does not want to be personally liable for any decision by the current or the incoming committee. He then informed that if there is a change in the committee, they must be made aware of the situation and detriments of the Selangor Bar members.
- 7.25 Dato' Joy thanked the Chairman and Yu Ai Ting. He then informed that the issue has been made known to BC since last year, as such there was ample time to deliberate. So, do not play moral game on the Selangor Bar because BC did not do their job. He added that the Selangor bar members especially the smaller firms needs this service and we need to act fast as it expires soon and let us move forward.
- 7.26 Wee Su Lin expressed her view but was interjected by Farez Jinnah. Sandosh Anandhan informed the Chairman as a point of order Farez Jinnah was given his opportunity to speak and he did and now he must give way to other members who wishes to speak. Farez Jinnah raised his voiced and informed Sandosh Anandhan not to touch him.



- 7.27 Wee Su Lin referred to para 2(C) of the motion about the renewal period of one year for 2023 which was because the fact that Selangor Bar has accepted the proposal by BC whereby the BC was to enter into negotiation with LN in 2023 for the whole of Malaysian Bar inclusive of the Selangor Bar. She added that last year we only passed a motion for 1 year instead of 2 years to give the BC the time to negotiate with LN. She added that this service to our members is the legacy of the Selangor Bar as we have created something for the benefit of our members regardless of how big or how small or how much money we have.
- 7.28 Wee Su Lin then referred to the circular posted by BC on 22nd February 2024 (No.068/2024) which was posted around 2pm. She quoted one of the paras from the circular and informed that our subscription is expiring on 29th February, 2024. But their commencement date is 1st July, 2025 which makes our members will not be able to access for almost more than a year. She added that one year has given to BC to negotiate according to para 2(C) of the motion and now we have to wait without access to LN. She does not know what transpired at council level since it is confidential but they have failed to do so. We are expected to wait for more than a year to get access again to this services which is not fair. The BC is going on moral high grounds and informing the Selangor Bar that we are not acting as brothers and sisters of the Bar. We have actually done what we can and we have reduced our extension from 2 years to one and she applauded the current committee for their courage. She added that she is a proud member of the Malaysian Bar but based on what transpired today she feels the BC is oppressing the Selangor Bar. She added that this is a minority oppression because the BC thinks we have to sacrifice our rights. She added that she is in favour of the motion.
- 7.29 A.G. Kalidas informed the Chairman that he is saddened on this matter and this should not have happened and we must stand united. He then added that Kokila Vaani has sat at the members seating and not at the committee table. She is the Bar Representative and due respect must be given to her and she should be given a chance to address her views on this matter as we only know what the committee is informing the members and we need to know what is happening at council level. He added that we must stand united and cannot be seen as against the BC.
- 7.30 A.G. Kalidas queried as to the reason the BC disagrees with Selangor Bar to continue with the LN subscription. He informed further that from his point of view, the Selangor Bar is getting a good deal with more products, the BC is envy of us and do not want the Selangor Bar to continue with the services. He added that this is not a proper argument and we need to find a middle ground. He has been saying this consistently from the beginning that it is not the way to look at members. He added that we all should be united and should not have come to this extent and in fact we do not need this motion from his point of view. But it has been proposed to the August House now as it can be resolved earlier and not here. If the reason is because we are getting it cheaper and with better products, that is why we are keeping it, that is not a convincing argument, he has to say it with greatest respect. He added that the motion is not fantastically drafted as we can view, but if the motion was passed, do not think as we are sending a message to BC as the motion is only giving the mandate to the SBC to proceed with the LN subscription. He



appealed for the current committee and the incoming committee to work together with the BC and to solve this issue amicably. He informed that the council members present can quote his name to LN not to divide the members. He added that we should not forget that the BC has funded RM1.3M for this service to all members of the Malaysian Bar. He then acknowledged Bernard Scott and the committee then whom have worked very hard to get the LN subscription rolling.

- 7.31 A.G. Kalidas further informed that LN did not want to settle the matter with BC and subsequently there was a law suit as there was a mistake made. Thereafter, there was an EGM organised by the BC and we lost four service providers and he convinced LN to join the EGM but they refused. He has answered more than 100 questions from members on the law suit. Thereafter, LN approached BC for a settlement of RM1.3M.
- 7.32 A.G. Kalidas added further that LN should have the courtesy of at least extend the same product to BC not specially only to the Selangor Bar. He humbly reminded the floor not to fall into the trap and proposed the current and incoming committee to work together for the nation and do not stop something that is good.
- 7.33 Annou Xavier proposed to the Chairman to open the vote for Motion 1 and proceed with Motion 2. He then informed the Chairman that online members are patiently waiting.
- 7.34 Fahri Azzat informed the Chairman that he wants to clarify the statement made by A.G. Kalidas and said that it is not about the collective bargaining power for BC but for everyone.
- 7.35 Farez Jinnah informed the floor that it is not true that BC failed to negotiate and the BC already had negotiated with LN at all but in fact had contacted SBC on negotiating with LN. He added that we also had the members of the SBC in the Bar Council's negotiating Committee. He added further that the President was waiting just now to address the floor and give a full picture regarding the matter but she was not allowed to. So, we only hear views from the Selangor Bar which is one-sided and to pursue this motion.
- 7.36 Farez Jinnah informed the floor that the product that A.G. Kalidas mentioned earlier was clearly given the best to Selangor Bar and LN is dividing all members as brothers and sisters. He added further that at any material time BC negotiating committee has always requested for the same deal but LN refused to provide the same deal and has perpetuated the idea of a better deal with Selangor Bar, irrespective they knew the fact that the party they can negotiate is the BC and now BC has been in good faith in negotiating and we found out that they have given a quote directly to the SBC.
- 7.37 Farez Jinnah informed the Chairman that BC is not discriminating the Selangor Bar and reminded the Selangor Bar not to fall into the trap by engaging with LN. He added that the said motion should be withdrawn or voted down. Farez Jinnah thanked the Chairman.
- 7.38 Vishnu Kumar referred to Section 73 (ii) of Legal Profession Act 1976; Powers of the State Bar committee which is to promote and safeguard the interests of advocates and



- solicitors who are members of the State Bar and (v) which is to provide amenities for and generally to promote the welfare of members of the State Bar. He added that the provision defeats the argument that Selangor Bar has to sacrifice for the rest of other state bar members because of the BC. He informed the Chairman that the power and duty given by the statute to the Selangor Bar members comes first.
- 7.39 Vishnu Kumar informed the Chairman that the second issue which was advocated was that whether only the President of the Malaysian Bar should sign the LN contract. He added that argument is to be defeated because in 2018 the agreement was signed by the Chairman of Selangor Bar and all this while it was signed by the Chairman of the Selangor Bar. He added that we have the authority and if we go by analogy, the booking of this AGM venue is a contract between the Selangor Bar and the Club. The President of the Malaysian Bar does not sign this contract otherwise this committee will just be a postman.
- 7.40 Vishnu Kumar further informed that the LN products for the Selangor Bar is worthy for the members to pay RM60.00 where if the motion or LN do not exist, the members have to pay higher for the whole product. He reminded the members that we must focus our rights and interests. He reminded further that SBC should protect all the members before, now and future.
- 7.41 Salim Bashir commented that BC should not relate moral grounds to support the argument and in fact the SBC tabling the motion shows that we are sitting on higher moral grounds. He added that BC should not speak about moral compass as they are the ones being sued and no state bars were sued before by any parties engaged. Do not ever use moral grounds to go against the motion. The BC did not give any gauge whether they have entered into any agreement and they have projected that the LN services will commence on 1st July, 2025 but it is uncertain. He informed the floor that BC has not given an exact date on the continuation of negotiation with LN. The LN did not enter into any deal because they are not benefitting with smaller states comparing with Selangor who have 7000 over members with a better deal and package. But we expect LN to give the same deal to smaller states and it will not work out as what BC wants. He added that for the last one year they have faked to negotiate and now the BC is envy of Selangor Bar on the product given by LN. He added that in the event the BC could not secure a deal with LN, the Selangor Bar will not have access to this service if this motion is withdrawn. He added further that as far as the law is concerned, he referred to Sec 73 of the LPA; Power of the State bar which is to provide amenities to the Selangor Bar members and there should be no issue about the power of Selangor Bar as a legal entity. Salim Bashir informed further that if need be, he will propose in the LPA that provides the Selangor Bar to have legal entity to execute an agreement.
- 7.42 Dato' George Varughese thanked the Chairman and according the Fahri Azzat's explanation, the BC did try to secure something at National level but unfortunately it has not come into any agreement at this stage. He added that Salim Bashir has mentioned that at this stage, we are not sure when and if any agreement will be concluded by the BC and that is the reality of the matter as it stands. He then informed the Chairman that he is



certain that the BC is aware of the Selangor Bar's agreement which will expire on 29th February 2024. So, all the more reason there should have been a little bit more effort by BC to come to some form of conclusion before end of February 2024 in order not to jeopardise what is Selangor Bar members is currently enjoying if the renewal does not take place.

- 7.43 Dato' George Varughese informed the Chairman that signing of LN agreement by the SBC and if the SBC is to enter into an agreement is something detrimental to the members is a form of threat and it is unwarranted. He informed further that BC should not threaten SBC in relation to the signing of the agreement with LN. He then referred to Farez Jinnah's statement that the motion should not be proposed by SBC. He added that members do not have the information and they did not negotiate with LN and they will not be able to inform the house on the deal. Therefore, it is only right for the SBC to put the motion before the August House especially in view of the fact that the existing agreement is coming to an end this month.
- 7.44 Dato' George Varughese further informed that the threatening issue of signing the agreement should not be affected as we are voting for the motion. We will cross the bridge when we come to it if at all the President or whoever she delegates the powers to refuses to sign the agreement which is a different issue altogether.
- 7.45 Dato' George Varughese raised his concern about the compliance of competition law and further informed that earlier there was no issue on the compliance of competition law when BC signed the LN agreement previously and they are still trying to negotiate. He further queried that if the Selangor Bar has the service now, as to how can it breach the competition law. He informed further that we have this service since 2018 and do not think that the Selangor Bar have been called up by the Competition Commission in respect of any complains or charges and if at all it happens, we can cross the bridge at that point of time. He added further that the former President Ragunath Kesavan who was also a member of the Competition Commission gave a written opinion that it will not breach the Competition Law.
- 7.46 Dato' George Varughese further informed that previously the BC has signed an agreement with LN, the Selangor Bar was carved out as we have an existing agreement and that agreement does not cover the Selangor Bar and likewise if the Selangor Bar enters into an agreement with LN it does not stop the BC from negotiating with LN in getting a package for all other states and Selangor Bar can be remained carved out.
- 7.47 Dato' George Varughese agreed with A.G. Kalidas's view that we should work together with the BC. He then proposed to the Chairman for SBC to come to an agreement with the BC that we will extend the agreement for one year and not two years and give BC another year to negotiate with LN for the entire nation without depriving the Selangor Bar members for one year. He added that it is why the services must continue for a year and give time to BC to negotiate with LN. and He then urged all the members to vote for the motion. The Chairman thanked Dato' George Varughese.



- 7.48 A.G. Kalidas informed the Chairman about the competition law that he and Bernard Scott have received letters from Competition Committee requesting for certain details and we looked at the Acts and they do not have such power and we did reply to them. He added that a sub-committee was formed then and researched everything about Competition Law. Bernard Scott went for a meeting and explained to them about the matter. He informed the members that the competition law is a non-starter and subsequently nothing happened. Furthermore, now the LN service has been provided to the whole nation and how can BC complain about it now.
- 7.49 Fahri Azzat informed the Chairman that SBC members is part of the negotiation committee of the Bar Council and they understand the challenges and difficulties in negotiating a deal with LN. He added that there are guidelines issued last year July, 2023 being set for any contract entered by BC or any state bar where any extraordinary contract that exceeds RM150,000.00 must be referred to BC for approval. He added that the execution of such contract falls under the purview of the BC and not state bars. It is an operating guideline for BC and state bars.
- 7.50 Fahri Azzat informed the Chairman that BC does not envy the Selangor Bar and there are also concerns raised about disparity between Selangor Bar and the other state bars. He added further that there is no threat and the matter has been discussed at Council with thorough views. He added that we are fellow brothers and sisters and we all must have the same view. He then quoted Shanker Sundaram's view where there are other service providers too and he is informed that this is not a solution and not acceptable. We are in a very hard situation now and we need to find a solution for every member and sometimes it is not easy to find any. He then suggested to the members to stand together on this matter as there are other service providers we can rely on for now. What the BC wants is LN provides the same deal and package for everyone. He informed that he was hoping that the President and the Secretary will be called in to deliberate as they have more knowledge on this matter.
- 7.51 Vishnu Kumar informed the Chairman that the guidelines mentioned is invalid and ultra vires to the statute of the state bar. He then informed the Chairman that some of the members proposed to amend the date in the motion from 1st March 2024 to 29th February 2024. The Chairman thanked Vishnu Kumar.
- 7.52 Kokila Vaani informed the Chairman that the reason as to why BC did not close the deal with LN was because same products offered to the Selangor Bar was not offered to the BC as a whole. She informed further that the reason given by LN during their meeting is because of the issue of licensing. So, it was perplexing for the BC whether LN is not being truly honest. As such, it is not BC against Selangor Bar or vice versa and the actual reason is why LN could not provide the same package to the BC.
- 7.53 The Chairman informed the members to keep their views/queries short as online members have requested to proceed with the voting.



- 7.54 Dato' Rajpal Singh proposed to the Chairman for BC to revisit their guidelines. He informed the Chairman that BC has to be united and do not interfere in the affairs of the state bar which has never happened before. He added that there are past Presidents, Council members who are present and informed that the incoming Council to reconsider their stand and not to interfere with the state bars' affairs. He then informed all the members to vote for the motion and informed that RM60.00 is only RM0.20 a day which is a very good deal and if the motion is not passed it is going to cost almost RM3000.00 per member for the same service. He then thanked the Chairman.
- 7.55 Shanker Sundaram informed the Chairman that he could not care less about the argument between the BC and Selangor Bar. He queried as to what is so special with LN compared to other 3 service providers which we already subscribed to. The committee did not inform the members what LN is providing compared to the other service providers. He queried further whether the SBC has any data of the members who are actively using LN. He then added that it is unfair for those who are not actively using LN to pay for the fees. He requested the Chairman to address the floor about the specialty to continue the contract with LN prior to 2022 and added that the motion should be opposed. He then thanked the Chairman.
- 7.56 Wee Su Lin proposed to the Chairman to start the voting and added that members do need the LN and the specialty of the products can be read from the motion.
- 7.57 K.A. Ramu informed the Chairman that on behalf of the one-man-show legal firms, he proposed that members should support the motion.
- 7.58 Chan Chee Thong informed the Chairman that he supports the motion because it offers whole range of products and it has assisted in his daily chores as a lawyer and the fee is reasonable.
- 7.59 Yu Ai Ting informed the floor that online members have requested not to take any more questions and to proceed with the voting. The Chairman informed the floor that they will proceed with the voting. Vishnu Kumar informed that the date must be amended to 29th February, 2024 before putting it to vote. The Chairman took note.
- 7.60 The Chairman requested all the pupils to be seated at the red seats and reminded them that they are not allowed to vote.
- 7.61 Ramesh Lachmanan requested the Chairman to read out the amended motion before commencing with the vote. The Chairman agreed. Vishnu Kumar requested Yu Ai Ting to read out the amended motion
- 7.62 Yu Ai Ting replied that the date in the motion is correct which is 1st March, 2024. Yu Ai Ting informed further that there is no amendment to be made. The Chairman informed the members that the voting process is via online for both physical and online members.



7.63 Choi Kian You informed that there are pupils online, they should be moved to the waiting room. The Chairman informed that the service providers are doing it.

7.64 Yu Ai Ting informed the members that the results of the voting is ready and as is as follows:

For : 428

Against : 43

Abstain : 28

Yu Ai Ting informed further that the Motion 1 is carried.

7.65 Yu Ai Ting then referred to motion 2 and informed all the members that due to the surplus in the account, the proposed annual subscription fees for 2024 year is maintained at RM200.00 instead of increasing it to RM260.00 per member.

7.66 The Chairman then added and recorded his appreciation to all the members and informed that Selangor Bar maintains the subscription fees of RM200.00 as to give back to all the members and the cost of LN services for the 1st year will be absorbed by the Selangor Bar. Dato' Rajpal Singh congratulated the committee for a wonderful job.

7.67 Choi Kian You proposed for the motion 2 to be amended in relation to the amount of subscription fees and Yu Ai Ting took note of that. Yu Ai Ting read the amended motion. Choi Kian You then proposed for motion 2 to be withdrawn. Yu Ai Ting withdrew motion 2.

7.68 The Chairman informed all the members that we will proceed with Agenda 5

7.69 The Chairman informed the floor that it will be put to vote and queried whether it is unanimous.

7.70 Vishnu Kumar queried the Chairman as to why Motion 2 was withdrawn. Yu Ai Ting replied it was withdrawn because Motion 1 was carried and as such the Selangor Bar will absorb the cost for LN services and members need not pay for the LN services subscription. Vishnu Kumar proposed that we record as we withdrew because now the annual subscription is at RM200.00 and the SBC is fully paying for the LN services.

7.71 Salim Bashir reminded the Chairman to identify the difference between the payment for LN online services and the annual subscription for the Selangor bar.

7.72 Vishnu Kumar informed the Chairman that in order to maintain Motion 2, we amend it to read as to collect the member RM0 per year for LN online services and the balance has been subsidised by the Selangor Bar Committee making the total subscription fees for 2024 RM200.00.



- 7.73 Yu Ai Ting read to the floor the amended motion 2 ‘if the answer is in affirmative, the Selangor Bar Committee will fully subsidise the renewal of the 2024 subscription for LN online services’.
- 7.74 The Chairman queried the members present and online whether if it is unanimous, we need not put it to vote. Ramesh Lachmanan proposed that the Chairman request to the members online whether there are any objections. As there were no objections, the Chairman informed the members that Motion 2 is unanimously carried.

ITEM 5 OF AGENDA:

To fix the Annual Subscription for the year 2024.

- 5.1 The Chairman informed the members that Selangor Bar Committee has proposed for the subscription fees to be fixed at RM200.00. The Chairman queried whether there any objections or anyone abstaining to the proposal.
- 5.2 The Chairman informed all the members that there are no objections from online members. He then informed the members that the subscription fee for 2024 is fixed at RM200.00.
- 5.3 Desmond Ho recorded his appreciation to the Chairman and the committee.
- 5.4 The Chairman thanked the members for giving the committee a good term and he acknowledged all the thank you notes.
- 5.5 The Chairman invited Dato’ George Varughese to preside over items 8, 9 and 10 of the agenda.

ITEM 8 OF AGENDA:

To elect one (1) member as Chairman of the Selangor Bar Committee for the year 2024/2025.

- 8.1 Dato’ George Varughese thanked the Chairman and the outgoing committee members. He then convened the meeting and called for the nomination for Chairman of the Selangor Bar Committee for the ensuing year.
- 8.2 M K Thas was proposed by Chan Chee Thong and seconded by Muniandy.
- 8.3 Salim Bashir queried whether the nomination will be done physically or via online. Dato’ George Varughese then informed that since it is a hybrid meeting, it will be done both ways (physically and online) but for each nomination there must be a proposer and seconder.



- 8.4 Dato' George Varughese informed that he was just been informed that according to the notice issued to members, it is required the nominations to be done by way of online only. He continued that however, if the members on the floor are of the view that the nominations can also be done physically, he will then accept the nominations. Ramesh Lachmanan proposed and seconded by Dato' Rajpal Singh. Dato' George Varughese proposed for the nomination to be taken physically as well and queried whether there are any other nominations.
- 8.5 Yogendra Nadarajan was proposed by Eugene Roy and seconded by Woon Ling Li.
- 8.6 Dato' George Varughese informed that if there are similar nominations via online, we need not consider that because of the same nominations and he will take the nominations from the floor first.
- 8.7 Fahri Azzat was proposed by Rusnaini Md. Nor via online. Fahri Azzat respectfully declined the nomination.
- 8.8 Cassandra Lee Tze Hui was proposed by Steve Koh Kok Ming via online and seconded by Ashley Danker via online. Dato' George Varughese queried whether Cassandra Lee Tze Hui is present at the meeting physically or via online. He further informed that according to the record she is attending the meeting via online. He then informed that Cassandra Lee Tze Hui has responded and declined the nomination.
- 8.9 There being no other nominations, Dato' Suraj Singh proposed nominations to be closed, seconded by Gabriel Susayan.
- 8.10 Dato' George Varughese informed that voting will take place online and all members are given three (3) minutes to cast their votes via online including members present physically.
- 8.11 Dato' George Varughese then informed that in 3 minutes, 85% of members present physically and online have voted and the votes are as follows:
- M K Thas : 276
Yohendra Nadarajan : 246
- Dato' George Varughese declared M K Thas as the Chairman of the Selangor Bar for 2024/25.
- 8.12 Salim Bashir proposed to Dato' George Varughese that for ease of convenience, we proceed with Item 10 before Item 9 of the Agenda.
- 8.13 Dato' George Varughese queried the members present whether there are any objections to the proposal by Salim Bashir. As there was no objection, Dato' George Varughese informed that we will proceed with Item 10.



ITEM 10 OF AGENDA:

To elect one (1) member to represent Selangor Bar on the Bar Council for the year 2024/2025.

- 10.1 Dato' George Varughese called for the nomination of candidates for Selangor Bar's Representative to the Bar Council for the ensuing year.
- 10.2 Yu Ai Ting was proposed by M K Thas and seconded by Nurul Muhaniza.
- 10.3 Eugene Roy was proposed by Dato' Joy and seconded by Gabriel Susayan.
- 10.4 Richard Teh was proposed by Chye Yee Peng. Richard Teh declined the nomination.
- 10.5 Yohendra Nadarajan was proposed by Chong Kien Man. Yohendra Nadarajan declined the nomination.
- 10.6 Dato' Suraj Singh proposed for the nomination to be closed seconded by Ramesh Lachmanan.
- 10.7 Dato' George Varughese informed that voting will take place via online and all members are given three (3) minutes to cast the votes. He then informed that there will be a pop-up window and to click on the same to cast the votes.
- 10.8 Dato' George Varughese then informed that members present physically and online have voted and the votes are as follows:

Eugene Roy	: 260
Yu Ai Ting	: 239

- 10.9 Dato' George Varughese announced that Eugene Roy is the Selangor Bar Representative to the Bar Council for the year 2024/25.

ITEM 9 OF AGENDA:

To elect ten (10) members as members of the Selangor Bar Committee for the year 2024/2025.

- 9.1 Dato' George Varughese called for nominations for the ten (10) committee members for the year 2024/2025.
- 9.2 The following candidates were nominated for election as committee members physically:

<u>No.</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Proposed By</u>	<u>Seconded By</u>
1.	Syahrul Syazwan	Fahri Azzat	Fazli Zakaria
2.	Yu Ai Ting	M K Thas	Bernard Scott



3.	Kuo Yih Shiuan (Bylian)	Kokila Vaniveloo	Yohendra Nadarajan
4.	Navin Punj	Yogendra Nandrajan	Kokila Vaniveloo
5.	Ambiga Rajendran	Agalya	Cassandra Nicole Thomazios
6.	Nurul Muhaniza	Yu Ai Ting	M K Thas
7.	Cyrus Tiu Foo Woe	Anou Xavier	Yohendra Nadarajan
8.	Cassandra Nicole Thomazios	Lesley Lim	Agalya
9.	Prabakaran V	James Chan Chee Tong	M K Thas
10.	Hj. Zainal Abidin	Teeruvrasu	James Chan Chee Tong
11.	Cindy Chow Li Kian	Chan Wei Yang	Ho Yong Yi
12.	Cassandra Lee Tze Hui	Kokila Vaniveloo	Yohendra Nadarajan
13.	Christopher Joseph	Ambiga Rajendran	Chan Chee Thong
14.	Richard Teh	M K Thas	Chan Chee Thong
15.	Afifuddin Afifi	M K Thas	Chan Chee Thong
16.	Samri Masri	Yohendra Nadarajan	Eugene Roy
17.	Durga Devi	Eugene Roy	Yohendra Nadarajan
18.	Johan Razi	Khairul Naim Rafidi	Navin Punj
19.	Normala M. Mokhtar	Syaza Zulkifli	Eugene Roy
20.	Nurul Izzati	Cassandra Lee Tze Hui	
21.	Wong Ling Li	Daphne Gan Siew Lim	Mei Yee Lam
22.	Khoo Ai Theng	Chong Kang Wai	Ng Kee Way
23.	Ng Kee Way	Ai Theng Khoo	Chan Kong Wai

9.3 M K Thas proposed for the nominations to be closed, seconded by Muniandy.

9.4 Dato' George Varughese informed that voting will take place online and all members can cast their votes via online.



- 9.5 Dato' George Varughese informed members present that online members are not being able to vote because the voting have not gone up as the we are still going through the nominations from online. As such, he requested the members to be patient as it may take some time to vote.
- 9.6 Dato' George Varughese informed the members that we have received 23 nominations in total and all the members are entitled to vote up to a maximum of 10 candidates and all members are given five (5) minutes to cast their votes.
- 9.7 Dato' George Varughese later announced the results of the election for committee members and declared the ten candidates with the highest number of votes as the elected Selangor Bar Committee members for the ensuing term, as follows:

No.	Name	Votes
1.	Richard Teh	258
2.	Yu Ai Ting	230
3.	Afifuddin Hafifi	219
4.	Ambiga Rajendran	210
5.	Cassandra Lee Tze Hui	182
6.	Syahrul Syazwan	181
7.	Cassandra Nicole Thomazios	176
8.	Cyrus Tiu Foo Woei	169
9.	Nurul Izzati	168
10.	Haji Zainal Abidin	167
11.	Prabakaran V	159
12.	Christopher Joseph	158
13.	Nurul Muhaniza	156
14.	Cindy Chow Li Kian	151
15.	Navin Punj	149
16.	Samri Masri	146
17.	Kuo Yih Shiuan (Bylian)	136
18.	Normala M. Mokhtar	134
19.	Johan Razi	133
20.	Durga Devi	122
21.	Wong Ling Li	58
22.	Khoo Ai Theng	57
23.	Ng Kee Way	49

- 9.8 Dato' George Varughese thanked the members for their patience and invited the Chairman to continue with Item 11 of the agenda.

**ITEM 11 OF AGENDA: General**

- 11.1 The Chairman thanked Dato' George Varughese for chairing the meeting. He then congratulated the Bar Representative and the incoming committee members. The Chairman then thanked all the members for attending the meeting.
- 11.2 Fahri Azzat informed the Chairman that from the experience from the hybrid meeting should be avoided at the next AGM. The Chairman assured that the incoming committee would definitely look into this matter.
- 11.3 K.A. Ramu informed the Chairman that he agrees with Fahri Azzat and informed that there are many members who are not IT savvy and proposed to the Chairman for a physical meeting for the next AGM. The Chairman thanked K.A. Ramu for his view.
- 11.4 The Chairman thanked all the members who have voted him and informed that he will try his best to improve. He then informed all the incoming committee members to work hard for the term and thanked Dato' George Varughese for presiding over Item 8, 9 & 10 of the Agenda.
- 11.5 The meeting ended at 7.00pm.

YU AI TING
HONORARY SECRETARY
SELANGOR BAR COMMITTEE